

upon Bill Monroe. In this piece, Ron R. Roach has provided us with a readable and compelling analysis of Appalachian storytelling and musical expression that you are sure to enjoy. Next, we turn to the topic of Appalachian migration with Robert L. Ludke and Phillip J. Obermiller's analysis of the 2010 Census. As an Appalachian native who commutes from Bloomington, Indiana to Lexington, Kentucky for my job, I find decisions about commuting and migration to be a complicating factor in my life, a problem that is shared by many of my neighbors and fellow Appalachians. The third article, however, puts this difficulty in a more sobering perspective. In this piece, Stephen J. Scanlan examines the opportunity structures of the places of origin of Appalachian combat fatalities in the Iraq War. He finds that those who were killed in the war were more likely to come from disadvantaged communities in the region. This finding, in combination with other research correlating military service with income, race, ethnicity, educational level, and region of origin raises questions concerning the justice, fairness, and sustainability of our all-volunteer military services. Finally, Sarah A. Watson also addresses the issue of how place and region structure opportunity and livelihood strategies with a teaching/research note reflecting upon the difference that community and class make in the educational aims and practices of children's summer environmental camps in Appalachian Ohio. This issue concludes with our book review and media review sections, which include reviews of innovative music and film, and the work of Helen Matthews Lewis, Alessandro Portelli, and George Ella Lyon.

So, the following pages provide you with the Spring 2014 snapshot of Appalachian studies: bluegrass music, migration, environmental education, Helen Lewis, Alessandro Portelli, George Ella Lyon, and innovative film and music. If you think something is missing from the mix, I encourage you to help us fill in the blanks. The online submission portal is always open!

Shaunna L. Scott  
University of Kentucky

## "THE STORY OF BLUEGRASS:" CARLTON HANEY, BILL MONROE, AND REDEMPTION DRAMA IN THE FIRST BLUEGRASS FESTIVALS

BY RON R. ROACH

*Appalachia has been fertile ground for the development of distinctive American music, and two of the forms of music most closely associated with the region are country and bluegrass. Promoter Carlton Haney, a member of the Bluegrass Hall of Fame, was a significant figure in each of these musical genres, playing a major role in developing the careers of such performers as Loretta Lynn, Porter Wagoner, Merle Haggard, Conway Twitty, Reno and Smiley, and Bill Monroe. In 1965, Haney founded the world's first multi-day bluegrass festival in Fincastle, Virginia, and held important festivals into the 1970s, starting a movement that helped to define modern bluegrass and introduce it to a national audience. One of the most memorable features of Haney's early bluegrass festivals was "The Story of Bluegrass," a musical narrative recounting the creation of bluegrass as a musical genre. This paper uses the rhetorical theories of Kenneth Burke to examine "The Story of Bluegrass" as a redemption drama that played an important role in shaping bluegrass music and the legacy of Bill Monroe.*

Perhaps no issue has generated more vigorous discussion in Appalachian studies than the question of the production of culture. David Whisnant's *All That Is Native and Fine: The Politics of Culture in an American Region* (1983/2009) was an early and influential work in this dialogue. Whisnant later wrote that an important step in the development of his approach was his study of folk festivals in the 1970s, in which he raised such questions as: "Who decided what forms, examples, or 'carriers' of culture were considered important enough to preserve, document, and present to the public? How should they be presented? What was the public told (and not told) about that culture? What messages did the public seem to prefer (or be able) to hear? Where did such preferences and predispositions come from?" (1983/2009, xix). Such issues remain valid as we consider contemporary notions of Appalachian culture. As French sociologist Pierre Bourdieu wrote: "No cultural product exists by itself" (1993, 32). Cultural products—whether

---

Ron R. Roach is Professor of Appalachian Studies at East Tennessee State University, where he serves as chair of the department.

they be festivals, novels, films, songs, sculptures, or other artifacts—are the result of a complex set of interrelated forces and invite analysis using a variety of critical tools.

One such critical approach is found in the work of critic and rhetorician Kenneth Burke, who believed that rhetoric was the fundamental means by which humans construct the symbolic narratives that define both individual and cultural identity. Thus, Burke famously called literature and art “equipment for living” (1973, 304). The approaches of Whisnant and Burke complement those of theorists in other fields who have studied the symbolic production of culture. For example, in the early twentieth century, historian Van Wyck Brooks urged critics to create a “usable past” for American literature: “Discover, invent a usable past we certainly can, and that is what a vital criticism always does” (1918, 223).<sup>1</sup> This paper uses Burke’s theories to analyze the development of bluegrass music festivals, which are a prominent part of contemporary Appalachian culture. Whereas most researchers have approached the development of bluegrass music from historical or ethnomusicological perspectives, relatively few have focused on the rhetorical features of the genre.<sup>2</sup>

No style of music has become more identified with Appalachia than bluegrass, and a common misconception holds that bluegrass is simply traditional Appalachian music. However, it has often been noted that Bill Monroe, the acknowledged “Father of Bluegrass,” was actually from western Kentucky, and that bluegrass is a fairly recent development, emerging only in the mid-twentieth century. As country music historian Bill C. Malone put it: “Bluegrass is neither Appalachian nor very old” (2004, 125). Nonetheless, Monroe shared a common musical heritage with much of the music in Southern Appalachia, and bluegrass music emerged from a synthesis of musical styles that were strong in the mountains, including country, old-time, blues, and gospel.<sup>3</sup> From early in its development, bluegrass music resonated in Appalachia, and many of the themes that would become associated with the genre were drawn from the Appalachian experience (Cantwell 1984; Daniel 2012; Erbsen 2003). Many musicians who played key roles in the history of bluegrass were from Appalachia, adjacent foothills, or areas strongly influenced by migration from Appalachia. Geographer George Carney has argued that Southern Appalachia served as a “cultural hearth” for bluegrass (1987a, 1987b).<sup>4</sup> Regardless of its geographic origin, bluegrass music is now indelibly linked to Appalachia in popular culture, and the music enjoys tremendous popularity in the region.

But this was not always the case. Less than fifty years ago, bluegrass fans were relatively few in number, bluegrass festivals did not yet exist, and bluegrass was struggling to be recognized as a musical genre. Promoter Carlton Haney played a major role in changing that situation. Once

dubbed the “P. T. Barnum of Country Music” (Pugh 1977), Haney was from Reidsville, North Carolina, a small tobacco and textile town just south of Danville, Virginia, in the foothill fringe of Appalachia. Reidsville, like many such towns along the Southern Railway, was a popular destination for Appalachian mountaineers seeking work in the mills in the early twentieth century.<sup>5</sup> Dominated by the massive brick smokestack of the American Tobacco Company, Reidsville, along with Danville and the surrounding area, played a key role in the history of old-time, country, and bluegrass music.<sup>6</sup> Influential banjoist Charlie Poole was from the nearby mill town of Spray, New Carolina. Bluegrass musicians Bobby Hicks and Allen Shelton were from the Reidsville area; Jim Eanes grew up just across the state line in Henry County, Virginia.

A 1939 Works Progress Administration (WPA) travel publication described the drive along US Highway 29 between Danville and Reidsville, indicating the important role that music played on the farms that covered the landscape during the formative years of country and bluegrass music:

[T]he road follows a high ridge through a region of farms marked by tobacco barns, crude log affairs which nevertheless appear more substantial than the cabins of the tenant croppers. During August and September smoke curls from the chimneys day and night, the flare at evening lighting a solitary attendant or a scene made gay by the banjo strumming, singing, and dancing of a group tending the curing fire. (Federal Writers’ Project 1939, 372)

A number of important early country and bluegrass musicians were periodically based in Danville. Both the Morris Brothers and Wade Mainer appeared on radio stations in Danville in the late 1930s and early 1940s (Erbsen 2003; Spottswood 2010). Lester Flatt and Earl Scruggs began their storied partnership at WDVA radio in Danville in 1948 after leaving Bill Monroe’s Blue Grass Boys. For a few weeks, they added Eanes to their band, as he was already working at the station (Willis 1998). Jim and Jesse McReynolds, the Louvin Brothers, and Reno and Smiley also served stints at WDVA. Herb Rice, his brother-in-law Hal Poindexter, and Poindexter’s brothers Leon and Walter, who in the early 1960s formed the Golden State Boys bluegrass band in California, were from the Reidsville-Danville area. Herb Rice’s sons Larry, Tony, and Wyatt lived from time to time in the area and later became important bluegrass musicians (Stafford and Wright 2010).<sup>7</sup> Finally, Bill Monroe’s brother Charlie spent his final years in Reidsville, passing away in 1975.

In 1949, WDVA began hosting the Virginia Barn Dance, later broadcast nationally by the Mutual Network, and in the early 1950s, Clyde Moody and his Woodchoppers were the headline act.<sup>8</sup> Moody, an early member

of Bill Monroe's Blue Grass Boys, introduced Carlton Haney to Monroe in Danville in 1953 or 1954. Haney was dating Bill Monroe's daughter Melissa, who was staying with the Moodys at the time. Haney became Monroe's booking agent for about a year before serving as manager for Reno and Smiley from 1955 to 1966 (Bartenstein 2012a).<sup>9</sup>

Haney, a visionary, entrepreneur, and born showman, was among the first to move country music from the school and theater circuit into large civic arenas across the nation. He played a key role in developing the careers of some of the biggest stars of country and bluegrass music, including Loretta Lynn, Porter Wagoner, Merle Haggard, the Osborne Brothers, Conway Twitty, Bill Monroe, and Reno and Smiley. Inspired by the Newport Folk Festival, by one-day bluegrass shows in Virginia,<sup>10</sup> and by folklorist Ralph Rinzler's emerging work on Bill Monroe's role in bluegrass history, Haney originated the multi-day bluegrass festival, holding the first two at Cantrell's Horse Farm in Fincastle, Virginia, in 1965 and 1966. In 1967, he moved the festival to Berryville, Virginia, and from 1969 on, staged it on a farm in Camp Springs, North Carolina, near Reidsville.<sup>11</sup> Haney became well known for promoting bluegrass music with a religious fervor.

A unique feature of Haney's early festivals was an event called "The Story of Bluegrass," a program of narration and songs that recounted Haney's vision of the origins of bluegrass music. Ironically, while few people attending bluegrass festivals today have ever heard of the "Story of Bluegrass," Haney stated that his main purpose in holding the first festival was to provide a venue for staging his "Story" (Bartenstein 2004, 187; 2012b).<sup>12</sup> The title of the "Story" would lead one to envision an account that highlighted the contributions of many artists. In reality, Haney intended to tell the story of one man's musical journey: Bill Monroe. In Haney's narrative, the story of bluegrass *was* the story of Monroe. Haney stated: "What Bill Monroe plays is bluegrass, and what everybody else plays is just a copy of him." He insisted that "bluegrass" should properly be written as two words, since that is how Monroe spelled the name of his band (Bartenstein 2004, 188).

Monroe is widely acknowledged today as the most important figure in the development of bluegrass, but in the early sixties he was the ideal tragic hero for Haney's drama. After breaking up with his brother Charlie in 1938, Monroe formed the Blue Grass Boys and began developing a new sound in country music. A key moment came in December 1945, when Earl Scruggs joined the band. This band, with Monroe on mandolin, Lester Flatt on guitar, Scruggs on banjo, Chubby Wise on fiddle, and Howard Watts on string bass formed what is now widely known as "the original bluegrass band." This band, fusing Monroe's driving mandolin with the lead vocals

and rhythm guitar of Flatt and the innovative three-finger banjo style of Scruggs, defined the bluegrass sound.

By the early sixties, Monroe's role in this story was not widely known by the public. Flatt and Scruggs had left Monroe's band in 1948 and had gone on to achieve far greater popular and financial success than Monroe. Flatt and Scruggs embraced the folk music revival in the late 1950s, performing at the Newport Folk Festival and in a 1960 CBS television special. They then became household names through their own television show, with the lucrative sponsorship of Martha White Flour, and through prominent roles on *The Beverly Hillbillies* television series. At the same time, they had a string of hits on the country music charts. Much of this success was due to the astute management of Louise Scruggs, Earl's wife (Rosenberg 2005).

In contrast, Monroe seemed remote and old-fashioned. He was much slower to get involved with the folk music movement, did not embrace television, had difficulty keeping a consistent lineup in his band, and struggled commercially during this period. Rinzler, who served for a time as Monroe's manager, made it his mission to restore Monroe's place in the history of bluegrass music. Rinzler engaged Monroe with the folk music movement and began writing about Monroe's role in the development of bluegrass, dubbing him "the Daddy of Blue Grass Music" (Rinzler 1963). In Carlton Haney, Rinzler found a powerful ally, and Haney's "Story" helped to take Rinzler's case to the masses.

In Haney's narrative, Bill Monroe was the central figure, repeatedly described as *the* creator of bluegrass music. In an important visual statement, Monroe remained on the stage throughout the drama, which lasted several hours. Monroe set this pattern during the first performance of the "Story," at Fincastle in 1965. As the Stanley Brothers were about to perform their part in the "Story," Haney prompted Monroe to go backstage. Monroe refused to leave, stating "I'll wait right here" (Haney 1965). Thus, Monroe ensured that the "Story" was still about him, even when he wasn't performing. He would follow this pattern during subsequent performances of the "Story," in keeping with Monroe's well-known tendency to demonstrate his physical prowess and endurance (Bartenstein 2012b).

The musical portion of the "Story" included Monroe's signature songs performed by various members of Monroe's band as it had evolved over the years, joined at times by other musicians who were at the festival. Haney controlled the performance, choosing and introducing each song, stating his views on the significance of the songs in the development of bluegrass, introducing the band members, and describing their role in Monroe's band.

### Kenneth Burke's Redemption Drama

The significance of Haney's "Story of Bluegrass" as a rhetorical strategy has not been fully explored.<sup>13</sup> This paper approaches the "Story" through Kenneth Burke's theory of the redemption drama. Burke, a prolific writer, served as editor of *The Dial* magazine in the 1920s and lectured widely at various colleges and universities into the 1980s. Burke had musical interests as well: a saxophonist and flutist, he served as music critic for both *The Dial* and *The Nation*. Folksinger Harry Chapin was Burke's grandson.

A major theme in Burke's writing is that an archetypal progression from guilt to redemption underlies much of human communication. Burke believed that we must recognize the inherent human need to confront guilt and other negative feelings and purge them through symbolic purification, thereby achieving a state of redemption. Burke used the term "guilt" to cover a wide range of negative feelings in addition to the traditional sense of the term, including anxiety, shame, embarrassment, and isolation (Littlejohn 2004, 167). Overcoming such guilt also helps us to achieve community with others. As David Bobbitt (2004) wrote: "Guilt is rooted in human nature because it is caused by that inevitable sense of division and separateness from others that resides in us as individual physical bodies who cannot have complete consubstantiality with other physical bodies. This sense of division is what we attempt to overcome through communication" (89).

Using Burke's terms, in the mid-1960s the nascent elements of the bluegrass movement were hindered by "guilt" or negative feelings. For example, the term "bluegrass" itself, as used to describe the musical genre, had only come into widespread use in the late 1950s (Rosenberg 2004, 98). The academic study of bluegrass had only just begun, with the work of Rinzier, Mayne Smith, and Neil Rosenberg. Scholars were starting to grapple with the question of the origins of the music, and one question emerged as a *stasis point* of the debate: Did the bluegrass music style begin with Bill Monroe and his Blue Grass Boys in 1939, with the infusion of Earl Scruggs's innovative banjo style into the Blue Grass Boys in 1945, or at some other point altogether?<sup>14</sup> Bluegrass was faced with a small and scattered fan base, with feelings of marginalization, and with serious feuds between some of its founding figures. Moreover, there was concern about the commercial viability of bluegrass in the face of the rock 'n' roll revolution, the British Invasion, and the emerging Nashville Sound in country music. Rhetorically, if bluegrass was to survive and grow, it had to be redeemed from sources of guilt. Carlton Haney and his "Story of Bluegrass" came at precisely the right moment to help satisfy this need.

In Burke's theory, redemption is achieved primarily through rhetorical victimage—by symbolically placing blame or sacrificing someone or something. Burke drew major inspiration from religious imagery and stated that

his theory is a sort of secular version of the Judeo-Christian redemption tradition (1970). Burke focused on two major means of *victimage*: *mortification* and *scapegoating* (1970). In the strategy of mortification, the rhetor makes him—or herself the victim by accepting blame or guilt, offering an apology, or otherwise mortifying the self. In the strategy of scapegoating, the rhetor places blame, guilt, or abuse on another person or group, thereby making them a symbolic sacrifice (scapegoat).

While mortification and scapegoating have received the most attention from scholars, Burke allowed for other means of redemption. Bobbitt (2004) analyzed the "I Have a Dream" speech of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., and included *dramatic catharsis* and *transcendence* as additional means of redemption drawn from Burke's theory. Carlton Haney's "Story of Bluegrass" functioned as a redemption drama through the processes of victimage (mortification and scapegoating), dramatic catharsis, and transcendence. These strategies were powerfully enacted through narration, music, choreography, and ritual in the "Story."

### Victimage and Dramatic Catharsis

Providing catharsis for the audience has been viewed as an important function of drama since the time of the ancient Greeks, who like Burke connected catharsis with purification and purgation (Sachs 2005). Aristotle wrote that "tragedy is an imitation of an action that is admirable, complete and possesses magnitude . . . effecting through pity and fear the purification [Gk, *katharsis*] of such emotions" (Aristotle 1996, location 1357). Burke believed that catharsis occurred when the audience witnessed the enactment of victimage. Thus, an "audience is purged by somewhat identifying itself with the excesses of the tragic hero" (1966, 186–89). Carlton Haney was the ideal man to stage such a ritual drama and was well aware of his flair for the dramatic, once commenting that, "I'm to bluegrass what John Ringlin' North was to the circus" (Pugh 1977, 117). As Rosenberg (2005) wrote, "Haney's mystic sense of the dramatic was added to Rinzier's research on the history of Monroe's music" (209). As Haney wove the narrative, the "Story" became in Burkean terms a dramatic enactment of symbolic sacrifice though victimage, utilizing the rhetorical strategies of both mortification and scapegoating to position Monroe as the creator of bluegrass.

Mortification took place as the various musicians took their places in the drama. By accepting their role in Haney's narrative, they were visibly submitting to Monroe as the "Father of Bluegrass." This was significant, as some of the most important figures from the first two decades of bluegrass participated in the "Story," including Don Reno, the Stanley Brothers, the Osborne Brothers, Mac Wiseman, Clyde Moody, Jim Eanes, Chubby Wise, Carl Story, and others. The participation of Carter and Ralph Stanley was

especially important because of Monroe's celebrated "feud" with them over the use of his music in the 1940s. Their appearance in the "Story" symbolically laid this feud to rest. As Rosenberg (2005) wrote: "He [Monroe] was now able to discuss in public the copying that had so bothered him because it was part of the 'Story,' a ritual in his honor" (209).

Haney positioned Lester Flatt and Earl Scruggs as symbolic scapegoats in the drama. Monroe had deeply resented Flatt and Scruggs for leaving his band, for their subsequent success, and for what he saw as their failure to give him the credit he was due. Monroe even attempted to bar Flatt and Scruggs from performing on the Grand Ole Opry. Flatt and Scruggs refused to appear with Monroe and did not participate in the early bluegrass festivals. Their absence, while leaving a potentially awkward hole in the "Story," left Haney free to assign them the part he desired. In the first "Story" in 1965, Haney stated it this way:

Then the waltz time was followed by instrumentals in the bluegrass beat and joining Bill Monroe then was two fellows that—one came from North Carolina and one came from Tennessee. We don't have them here with us today but we wished we could. Lester Flatt and Earl Scruggs. And they recorded many, many songs with Bill Monroe and a lot of them are in your collections today. We'd like to feature one of the instrumentals now that came about, about that day and time, with Bill Monroe playing the mandolin with this distinctive rhythm and time that very few of the other fellows had used but even then not as predominantly as he had. He'd taken the groups—or the music—that he'd played up to that time and set a rhythm pattern with his mandolin that's today used as the bluegrass beat. Although there were other fellows who were playing guitars and singing country music and music with some of this time in it, people heard on record a song called "The Blue Grass Breakdown." (Haney 1965)

Haney's narrative ignored the contributions of Flatt and Scruggs, positioning them as sidemen to Monroe. Further, Haney's use of "Blue Grass Breakdown" at this point was a significant rhetorical choice. This song, recorded in 1947 while Flatt and Scruggs were with Monroe, was not the most well-known song from Monroe's band during that period. However, the song became important when it was reworked by Scruggs into "Foggy Mountain Breakdown," which became the signature song of Flatt and Scruggs and one of the most famous bluegrass tunes ever written. Since the opening measures of "Blue Grass Breakdown" sound very similar to that of "Foggy Mountain Breakdown," Haney was musically underscoring his argument for Monroe's primacy, attempting to demonstrate that even

Flatt and Scruggs's signature song was based on one they had performed while in Monroe's band. On the original recording of "Blue Grass Breakdown," the song opened with Monroe on the mandolin while the second break featured Scruggs on the banjo (Monroe 1947). Significantly, when Monroe performed the song in the first "Story of Bluegrass," the banjo<sup>15</sup> opened the song, thus the audience could not miss the similarity to "Foggy Mountain Breakdown." Scruggs later stated that he composed "Blue Grass Breakdown" but that Monroe had not given him credit for it (Brown 2000). The general audience for "The Story of Bluegrass" in 1965 would not have known this fact.

In Burke's theory, dramatic catharsis and transcendence are closely related. While both lead to "transformation," transcendence involves constructing a symbolic or "terministic" bridge by which "one realm is transcended by being viewed in terms of a realm 'beyond' it" (1966, 186–91). Transcendence was an important rhetorical effect of the "Story of Bluegrass" and was achieved in at least three ways: through the drama's function as a form of ritual and communion; through the presentation of Monroe's music as "sacred;" and through the description and experience of the music in terms of the "beyond."

As Rosenberg (2005) and Bartenstein (2012b) have noted, the "Story" took on the role of a ritual in the early bluegrass festivals. The ritualistic nature of the "Story" derived partly from the communal aspects inherent in a bluegrass festival. Festivals in general have long been important sources of ritual. Catherine Bell, in her study of ritual, identified "feasting, fasting, and festivals" as one of the six major categories of "ritual action" (2009, location 2597). One way in which the early bluegrass festivals embodied ritual action was to draw upon the cultural backdrop of Christianity and gospel music, incorporating elements from traditional Southern and Appalachian rural church gatherings.<sup>16</sup> On Sunday morning of his festivals, Haney scheduled a gospel sing. As Rosenberg (2005) wrote, this provided a fitting introduction for the ritualistic "Story," which was performed on Sunday afternoon (206). The fact that the "Story" was repeated each year at the festivals, always on Sunday afternoon as the culminating event, reinforced its role as a ritual.

The "Story" also reinforced the sense of unity that festival attendees felt by being part of a communal experience. Church music historian Louis Benson (1915) described a similar phenomenon when discussing camp meetings of the American frontier South: "[T]he companionships of the rough journey to the camp reappear in songs of a common pilgrimage to Canaan, the meetings and partings on the grounds typify the reunion of believers in heaven, and the military suggestions of the encampment furnish many themes for songs of a militant host, brothers in arms in the battle of the

Lord" (293). The same sort of communal experiences figured prominently in later phenomena such as the church homecoming, the revival, and singing schools and conventions. Rinzler touched on this communal aspect of early bluegrass festivals: "But for me it was like going into another world. I was fascinated by the totally different lifestyle—dinner on the grounds, different speech patterns—a whole different way of life" (Rosenberg 2004, 97). A striking feature of the bluegrass festivals was the fact that they drew together disparate audiences: older fans, younger fans, college students, rural fans, urban fans, traditionalists, and hippies enjoyed the music together. Carlton Haney commented on this sense of community in the documentary *Bluegrass: Country Soul*, filmed at his 1971 Camp Springs, North Carolina festival:

Thousands of people come to the festival each year to see the great musicians. They also come to hear them play with each other because most of the people that attend a bluegrass festival pick or sing theirself. People come in sleeping bags, tents, campers. A lot of people sleep in a station wagon with a mattress inside of it. They drive for hundreds of miles. In fact, we've had people from foreign countries, like Japan, Canada. A lot of Canadians. The short hairs pick with the long hairs. They get along together, because they've got a common interest in the music. And they don't think of one another as one being one part of the country, another a different way of life. They're all together at the bluegrass festival and get along together. (Ihde 1971)

Another way in which "The Story of Bluegrass" functioned as ritual was through its presentation of Monroe's music as a "sacred" canon. Carlton Haney's opening words for the "Story" stressed this aspect, calling for reverence, as in this example from 1969:

This is our fifth festival and we always ask everybody here now to please, if you're on the grounds, just to stop wherever you are and we're going to start our Story. We start it with the song that he [Monroe] recorded in 1940 called "Mule Skinner Blues." So, we're going to ask everybody to be quiet and to please stop walking, if you're walking on the grounds, just long enough for us to start our Story. Just be real quiet and we're gonna start. (Haney 1969)

Haney went on to ask the audience for silence three more times before he allowed Monroe to begin the performance. The "Story" was organized around a series of songs chosen by Haney from Monroe's repertoire, like favorites from an old hymnal. The songs varied slightly from year to year, with one notable exception: "Mule Skinner Blues" always began the show.

"Mule Skinner Blues," popularized by Jimmie Rodgers,<sup>17</sup> had been the first song performed by Monroe in his first appearance on the Grand Ole Opry, in 1939. Monroe identified this song as the genesis of bluegrass, stating that "'Mule Skinner Blues' set the timing for bluegrass music" (Smith 2000, 56). Haney shared Monroe's view that this was the beginning of bluegrass, stating that "'Mule Skinner Blues' was the first one that I heard with this driving time" (Bartenstein 2004, 187). Haney often stressed this in the "Story," calling "Mule Skinner Blues" "the song that started it all" (Haney 1969). Thus, the "Story" presented Monroe's song as the most sacred anthem of bluegrass music, something to be revered and repeated.

Burke's definition of transcendence as the rhetorical construction of a "bridge between disparate realms" is reminiscent of the progression of thought in Aristotle's *Poetics*. Philosopher Joe Sachs observed that Aristotle, in his discussion of tragic drama, gradually replaced the term "catharsis" with the term "wonder." Sachs wrote that Aristotle

singles out wonder as the aim of the poetic art itself, into which the aim of tragedy in particular merges. Ask yourself how you feel at the end of a tragedy. You have witnessed horrible things and felt painful feelings, but the mark of tragedy is that it brings you out the other side. Aristotle's use of the word *catharsis* is not a technical reference to purgation or purification but a beautiful metaphor for the peculiar tragic pleasure, the feeling of being washed or cleansed. (2005)

The "Story of Bluegrass" achieved this kind of transcendence by describing the music in terms of the "beyond" and through the experience of the music itself. Robert Cantwell examined this aspect of early bluegrass festivals in his *Atlantic Monthly* article about his experience at Monroe's Bean Blossom festival in the summer of 1970, writing: "The themes of bluegrass music transcend otherworldliness, and at best they are genuinely metaphysical." Later in the article, he wrote: "I believe anyone who has ever played in a bluegrass band will testify that it can be a deeply satisfying and elevating experience, and at times—in those moments of transcendent cooperation—sublime" (2004, 203). Carlton Haney consistently spoke of bluegrass music in similar terms. Rosenberg (2005) wrote that "Haney was not only an intellectual, he was a home-grown mystic who expressed his belief in the strength of Bill Monroe's music in terms of 'vibrations'" (205). Haney's narration of the "Story" reinforced the transcendent feel of the event. Haney solemnly told the audience at the 1969 event: "And for the next three to three and a half hours we're gonna listen to music that you will never hear again, done just the way it will be done here. [This will be] the only time in the world that you'll hear these songs with these men. It's the greatest story of music today that you can hear live on a stage" (Haney 1969).

The music itself, like sacred anthems in a religious ritual, also provided a powerful bridge for transporting the audience beyond the here and now. In fact, Haney stated that he got the idea for a bluegrass festival and "Story" when he experienced a transcendent moment backstage at the Grand Ole Opry in 1957. Haney stated that this was when he first noticed the uniqueness of Monroe's style, which would "make the hair stand up on your arm. And then I thought if I could get the ones had sung with him—who knew it—they were the only ones could play it. So I thought if I could get all of them, or some of 'em, back together and let people hear what I heard in the dressing room they'd buy tickets for it" (Bartenstein 2004, 186). Similarly, participants in Haney's early festivals often described their experience in transcendent terms. Bartenstein wrote:

One moment from the 1966 festival remains especially vivid to this day. Bill Monroe and the Osborne Brothers were singing "I Hear a Sweet Voice Calling," and something almost indescribable happened: no one could move, and a complete stillness came over the entire audience, after which Bill and the rest of us broke into tears. It was a transcendent moment that couldn't be captured on tape, but anyone there will remember it. (quoted in Mosser 1999)

Bartenstein recently commented on this moment in Burkean terms, observing that "the line [of the song] continues, 'way up in heaven on high.' The words Bill, Sonny [Osborne], and Bob [Osborne] were singing were coming true as we listened, and Cantrell's Horse Farm became a 'thin place' between the earthly and cosmic realms."<sup>18</sup> Or, as Burke would say, a bridge between disparate realms.

### Legacy

"And Moses recited the words of this song from beginning to end in the hearing of the whole assembly of Israel. . . . Remember the days of old; consider the generations long past" (Deut. 31:30, 32:7, *New International Version*). Bartenstein observed that the "Story" presented Bill Monroe as though he were Moses descending from Mount Sinai (2012b, interview). Although Haney may have somewhat overstated Monroe's role, there is no denying that the "Story" functioned as a powerful rhetorical set piece. Once Haney silenced the crowd to his satisfaction, there was a pregnant pause before Bill Monroe's opening mandolin strokes on "Mule Skinner Blues" split the silence. As the full band joined in and Monroe's "high lonesome" tenor began ("Good morning, Captain!"), the effect was electrifying. Recordings of the events still convey a sense of that drama today.

The "Story of Bluegrass" was performed at least eight times at Haney's festivals from 1965 to 1970. There were some attempts to duplicate its suc-

cess with "stories" about other performers, such as the Stanleys and the Osbornes. Such events never caught on, perhaps partly because the unique rhetorical function of the "Story" as a creation myth did not allow space for other narratives. Haney continued holding festivals at Camp Springs through the 1970s, but they gradually declined. This was partly due to Haney's success, as bluegrass festivals following his model quickly spread across the country.<sup>19</sup> In addition, Haney's business practices and difficulties led to financial problems and disputes with performers, and he became embroiled in a legal battle with the American Federation of Musicians (Pugh 1977; Bartenstein 2012a). In 1998, the International Bluegrass Music Association (IBMA) inducted Carlton Haney into its Hall of Fame, recognizing his contributions as a promoter, booking agent and manager, songwriter, and the originator of the multi-day bluegrass festival. Haney remained a passionate advocate for bluegrass music and for Monroe's role in the music until his death in 2011 (Bartenstein 2012a).

The "Story of Bluegrass" functioned as a redemption drama for the early bluegrass movement, symbolically purifying and unifying the movement through the use of the rhetorical strategies of victimage, dramatic catharsis, and transcendence. This symbolic redemption contributed to several outcomes. First, the "Story" helped to establish the "Monroe-centric" view of the origin of bluegrass music. Haney stated: "My only reason to put on a bluegrass festival was to let the world know that it all came from Bill Monroe, that's the only reason. I wanted to give him the credit before he died" (quoted in Bartenstein 2004, 188).<sup>20</sup> As Bartenstein has noted, not only did the "Story" help convince the public, it also reinforced Monroe's own acceptance of his seminal role (2012b). Thomas Adler has documented that Monroe was initially skeptical about Haney's ideas for the festival and a "Story" but was won over by the success of both, which Monroe then emulated at his Bean Blossom park in Indiana (2011, 85). Monroe briefly tried to duplicate the "Story" at Bean Blossom, with Rinzler as narrator (Rinzler 1971). Rinzler, though more polished, lacked Haney's showmanship, and the "Story" did not last. Notably, however, at the 1971 Bean Blossom festival, Lester Flatt and Bill Monroe reconciled, ending another of bluegrass music's famous feuds (Smith 2000, 220).

Haney and Rinzler succeeded in their quest to establish Monroe's place in the history of bluegrass. While scholars still debate the exact sources of bluegrass, over time a more balanced view of its development emerged. Most scholars acknowledge the importance of Monroe as "the Father of Bluegrass" but also agree that the classic bluegrass sound emerged in 1945–1948, with the band that included Flatt and Scruggs. In particular, the role of "Scruggs-style" banjo picking is recognized, and the IBMA describes Scruggs as "one of the creators of bluegrass music." In 1991, when

the IBMA founded its Hall of Fame, the first inductees were Monroe, Flatt, and Scruggs (IBMA 2014).

Second, the success of Haney's festivals helped to provide a means of economic survival for many bluegrass musicians. As noted above, bluegrass musicians faced serious commercial challenges in the early 1960s, and some were concerned that bluegrass music might die out altogether. Bartenstein stated: "Bluegrass music had just been kicked out of country music at the time of that first festival. We all felt in '65 that we were attending an Irish wake for bluegrass" (quoted in Mosser 1999). Ralph Stanley remembered:

It [Haney's first festival] really got the festival circuit started, and that was the savior of our music for a lot of years. Otherwise, I think bluegrass might have faded out, because we couldn't have survived on record sales. Fincastle was the start of how we could make it financially. Carlton Haney was the organizer and the man that started it all. (Stanley and Dean 2009, 360)

A third consequence of Haney's "Story" and festivals was that they helped to push forward the development of bluegrass music as an art form and as a movement. Haney helped to unify the nascent constituents of the bluegrass community around a "sacred" history and mission. In Burkean terms, the "guilt" was purged, which allowed the actors to move beyond the feuds, to achieve identification with each other and with the fans, and to celebrate the music as a distinct and legitimate art form with a proud history. All of these steps helped to produce a "usable past" for the music and made possible the coalescing of disparate elements into a community. Richard Smith (2000) wrote that Haney's festivals were "a landmark. Monroe and Scruggs had made bluegrass a distinctive sound; fans and disk jockeys had named it as a genre; Rinzler had given it a history; and now Carlton Haney had turned it into a movement" (203).

More than six decades after its birth, bluegrass music is a dynamic musical genre. The creation, growth, and ongoing development of such a phenomenon is a complex process that defies simple explanation. However, there is no doubt that Carlton Haney's early bluegrass festivals were a critical point in the development of the bluegrass music community and the role of Bill Monroe in that community. Further research is needed on the rhetorical and cultural aspects of bluegrass and the role that bluegrass music has played in the production of culture in Appalachia. In addition, research is needed to analyze the rhetorical functions of mass media and commerce in the development of bluegrass, both as a musical genre and as an imagined community.

## Acknowledgement

I would like to thank Fred Bartenstein, who provided valuable insights into Carlton Haney and "The Story of Bluegrass" for this article.

## Notes

1. Brooks's argument itself represents an overt agenda for cultural production. See also such concepts as Benedict Anderson's imagined communities and Ernest Bormann's symbolic convergence theory.

2. For example, see Joti Rockwell's dissertation (2007), which focused on musical tropes, although not strictly from a rhetorical perspective, and John Bealle's article (1993), which examined the role of discourse at bluegrass festivals but did not examine Haney or the "Story of Bluegrass."

3. The standard work on the development of bluegrass is Rosenberg (2005).

4. Carney (1987a), analyzing data from the late 1960s and early 1970s, documented that a large percentage of bluegrass performers in that era was from Appalachia.

5. The author's grandparents were part of this migration pattern. In the early twentieth century his grandfather migrated to Reidsville from Henry County, Virginia, to work in the American Tobacco factory; his grandmother moved to Reidsville from Macon County, North Carolina, to work in a textile mill. For a discussion of such migration, see Huber (2008).

6. Bill C. Malone wrote that the Piedmont region of North and South Carolina was "in short, the birthplace of bluegrass music" (2004, 125). Huber (2008) argued that the hillbilly music of the 1920s and 1930s was largely created in the Piedmont region (from Virginia to Georgia).

7. The Poindexter brothers are the author's uncles.

8. The author's father, a guitarist and fiddler who grew up in Reidsville and knew Haney, got to know Moody during this time period and briefly performed with Moody and Eanes.

9. Bluegrass historian Fred Bartenstein attended the first bluegrass festival at Fincastle, worked as Haney's assistant and emcee for many of the early festivals, and served as editor of Haney's magazine, *Muleskinner News*. Bartenstein is one of the few scholars to closely analyze Haney's festivals.

10. Don Owens and John Miller promoted a "Blue Grass Day" at Watermelon Park near Berryville, Virginia, on August 14, 1960 (Saunders 2012). Bill Clifton organized a "Bluegrass Day" at Luray, Virginia, on July 4, 1961 (Rosenberg 2005, 177-78, 204).

11. Some of the author's most vivid childhood memories are of attending bluegrass festivals at Camp Springs in the early 1970s. Haney later operated a grocery store, "The Bluegrass Market," on the street where the author grew up. Haney lived in a small house across the street from the store. Customers rarely visited the store without hearing a story or two from Haney.

12. A memorable feature of the "Story" was Haney's distinctive pronunciation of the word. He always pronounced it "Stoh-ree," as many older folks did in that area of the South.

13. The fullest treatment is by Rosenberg in his influential *Bluegrass: A History* (2005), which includes a detailed discussion of the first "Story," pointing out some of its ritualistic aspects.

14. In classical rhetoric, *stasis* was the process of identifying the central question at issue in a debate.

15. Lamar Grier was the banjo player for Monroe at the 1965 festival.

16. For a discussion of such practices, see McCauley (1995). For analyses of Southern gospel music, see Graves and Fillingim (2004); and Harrison (2012).

17. Rodgers drew from earlier songs in the black folk tradition for his version of "Mule Skinner Blues," which was entitled "Blue Yodel No. 8" and released in February 1931 (Neal 2009, 35-37; Rosenberg and Wolfe 2007, 26).



18. Bartenstein, e-mail message to author, September 30, 2012. For a discussion of similar transcendent experiences, see Harrison (2012).

19. According to Carney, by 1972 there were at least 180 bluegrass festivals located in thirty-six states and one Canadian province (1987a, 169–77).

20. Of course, Haney also had economic motives for starting the festivals.

## References

- Adler, Thomas A. 2011. *Bean Blossom: The Brown County Jamboree and Bill Monroe's bluegrass festivals*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Aristotle. 1996. *Poetics*. New York: Penguin. Amazon Kindle digital file.
- Bartenstein, Fred. 2004. The Carlton Haney story. In *The bluegrass reader*, ed. Thomas Goldsmith, 185–90. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- . 2012a. Carlton Haney. *IBMA Hall of Fame members*. Owensboro, KY: International Bluegrass Music Association Museum, 2012. <http://www.bluegrass-museum.org/hall-of-fame/1998-inductee-carlton-haney>.
- . 2012b. Interview by author. March 17.
- Bealle, John. 1993. Self-involvement in musical performance: Stage talk and interpretive control at a bluegrass festival. *Ethnomusicology* 37 (1): 63–86.
- Bell, Catherine. 2009. *Ritual: Perspectives and traditions*. Rev. ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Amazon Kindle digital file.
- Benson, Louis F. 1915. *The English hymn: Its development and use in worship*. New York: Hodder and Stoughton.
- Bobbitt, David A. 2004. *The rhetoric of redemption*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Bordieu, Pierre. 1993. *The field of cultural production*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Brooks, Van Wyck. 1918. On creating a usable past. In *Van Wyck Brooks: The early years*, ed. Claire Sprague, 219–26. New York: Harper and Row, 1968.
- Brown, Paul. 2000. The story of "Foggy Mountain Breakdown." *NPR 100*. National Public Radio, April 1. <http://www.npr.org/2000/04/01/1072355/npr-100-earl-scruggs>.
- Burke, Kenneth. 1945. *A grammar of motives*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1969.
- . 1966. *Language as symbolic action: Essays on life, literature, and method*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- . 1970. *The rhetoric of religion*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- . 1973. *The philosophy of literary form*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Cantwell, Robert. 1984. *Bluegrass breakdown: The making of the old southern sound*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- . 2004. Believing in bluegrass. In *The bluegrass reader*, ed. Thomas Goldsmith, 202–10. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Carney, George O. 1987a. Bluegrass grows all around: The spatial dimensions of a country music style. In *The sounds of people and places: Readings in the geography of American folk and popular music*, ed. George O. Carney, 159–97. Lanham, MD: University Press of America.
- . 1987b. Country music and the South: A cultural geography perspective. In *The sounds of people and places: Readings in the geography of American folk and popular music*, ed. George O. Carney, 115–43. Lanham, MD: University Press of America.
- Daniel, Wayne W. 2012. Bluegrass. *Encyclopedia of Appalachia*. <http://www.encyclopediaofappalachia.com>.
- Ersben, Wayne. 2003. *Rural roots of bluegrass: Songs, stories, and history*. Asheville, NC: Native Ground Music.
- Federal Writers' Project. 1939. *North Carolina: A guide to the Old North State*. Raleigh: North Carolina Department of Conservation and Development. <http://books.google.com>.
- Graves, Michael, and David Fillingim. 2004. *More than precious memories: The rhetoric of southern gospel music*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press.

Haney, Carlton, narr. 1965. *The story of bluegrass*. Fincastle, VA, bluegrass festival. Audio recording.

———, narr. 1967. *The story of bluegrass*. Berryville, VA, bluegrass festival. Audio recording.

———, narr. 1969. *The story of bluegrass*. Camp Springs, NC, bluegrass festival. Audio recording.

Harrison, Douglas. 2012. *Then sings my soul: The culture of southern gospel music*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Huber, Patrick. 2008. *Linthead stomp: The creation of country music in the Piedmont South*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Ihde, Albert, dir. 1971. *Bluegrass: Country soul*. Time-Life Records. DVD.

International Bluegrass Music Association (IBMA). 2014. International Bluegrass Music Hall of Fame. <https://ibma.org/awards/hall-of-fame>.

Littlejohn, Stephen W. 2004. *Theories of human communication*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Malone, Bill C. 2004. Music. In *High mountains rising: Appalachia in time and place*, ed. Richard A. Straw and H. Tyler Blethen, 114–34. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

McCauley, Deborah Vansau. 1995. *Appalachian mountain religion: A history*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Monroe, Bill. 1947. Blue grass breakdown. *Sixteen gems*. Sony Music Entertainment, 1996. CD.

Mosser, Kurt. 1999. Fred Bartenstein: The right place at the right time. *Bluegrass Unlimited* 33 (May). <http://academic.udayton.edu/KurtMosser/bggrass.html>.

Neal, Jocelyn R. 2009. *The songs of Jimmie Rodgers*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Pugh, John. 1977. The P. T. Barnum of country and western music. *Hustler* 4 (November): 54–56, 111, 117, 124.

Rinzler, Ralph, narr. 1963. Bill Monroe—"The Daddy of Blue Grass Music." In *The Bill Monroe reader*, ed. Tom Ewing, 22–26. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2000. (Orig. pub. in *Sing Out!* 13 (1): 4–8.)

———. 1971. *The story of bluegrass*. Bean Blossom, IN, bluegrass festival. Audio recording. The Ken Landreth Collection. <http://frobbsi.org/landrethcollection.html>.

Rockwell, Joti. 2007. Drive, lonesomeness, and the genre of bluegrass music. PhD diss., University of Chicago.

Rosenberg, Neil V. 1967. The emergence of bluegrass. *Journal of American Folklore* 80 (316): 143–50.

———. 2004. Into bluegrass: The history of a word. In *The bluegrass reader*, ed. Thomas Goldsmith, 93–101. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

———. 2005. *Bluegrass: A history*. Rev. ed. Urbana: University of Illinois Press. (Orig. pub. 1985.)

Rosenberg, Neil V., and Charles K. Wolfe. 2007. *The music of Bill Monroe*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Sachs, Joe. 2005. Aristotle: Poetics. *Internet encyclopedia of philosophy*, ed. James Fieser and Bradley Dowden. <http://www.iep.utm.edu/aris-poe/>.

Saunders, Walt. 2012. Notes and quotes. *Bluegrass Unlimited* 46 (October): 10.

Smith, Mayne. 1965. An introduction to bluegrass. *Journal of American Folklore* 78 (309): 245–56.

Smith, Richard D. 2000. *Can't you hear me callin': The life of Bill Monroe, father of bluegrass*. Boston: Little, Brown.

Spottswood, Dick. 2010. *Banjo on the mountain: Wade Mainer's first hundred years*. Jackson: University of Mississippi Press.

Stafford, Tim, and Caroline Wright. 2010. *Still inside: The Tony Rice story*. Kingsport, TN: Word of Mouth Press.

Stanley, Ralph, and Eddie Dean. 2009. *Man of constant sorrow: My life and times*. New York: Penguin-Gotham.

Whisnant, David E. 1983/2009. *All that is native and fine: The politics of culture in an American region*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Willis, Barry R. 1998. *America's music: Bluegrass*. Franktown, CO: Pine Valley Music.